Internalizing the Demonic: Satan and the Self in Early Modern Scottish Piety

Michelle D. Brock

Journal of British Studies / Volume 54 / Issue 01 / January 2015, pp 23 - 43
DOI: 10.1017/jbr.2014.164, Published online: 16 January 2015

Journal of British Studies 54 (January 2015): 23–43. doi:10.1017/jbr.2014.164

Internalizing the Demonic: Satan and the Self in Early Modern Scottish Piety

Michelle D. Brock

Abstract Beliefs about the Devil informed Scottish piety in a myriad of ways. This article explores, in particular, the experiential relationship between Reformed theology, the practice of introspection, and demonic belief. It locates a process of profound anxiety and self-identification as evil that occurred during inward, personal engagement with Satan. This process, loosely coined here as "internalizing the demonic," reveals the close and consequential relationship between the clerical promotion of self-surveillance and the widely internalized belief in the Devil's natural affinity with the "evil hearts" of men and women. Through an examination of English texts circulated in Scotland and a brief comparison with Protestant groups abroad, this article suggests that internalizing the demonic was a defining component of experiential piety not just in Scotland, but also throughout the Reformed Anglophone world.

How did belief in Satan influence religious experience and identity in early modern Scotland? An example from the life of James Fraser of Brea, longtime minister of a parish near Fife, provides a good place to begin answering this question. Born in 1639, Fraser reportedly experienced a great deal of demonically induced turmoil prior to his conversion experience at age nineteen. In his memoirs, he told how, as a youth, he had committed "the dreadful sin of blasphemy" during a heated game of cards.[1] One night after speaking these unspecified abominations, Fraser struggled, and failed, to pray. He wrote, "[I] could not get my mouth opened; there did a number of blasphemies and cursings run in my mind with great horror and against my will, which I thought was like the devil in me."[2] Though the Lord temporarily relieved his troubles, a year later he heard a sermon that led him to recall and profoundly regret his prior sin of blasphemy: "I saw in God's countenance terror, wrath, hatred, and vengeance . . . I was in an hourly expectation [of] when Satan should come and take me away; and it was beaten upon me with a mighty impression that I was delivered to the devil."[3]

Michelle D. Brock is assistant professor of British history at Washington and Lee University. She gratefully acknowledges the advice and encouragement of Brian P. Levack, Neil Kamil, Julian Goodare, and Brian Cowan. She would also like to thank the anonymous reviewers of this article for their immensely helpful comments and criticisms.

[1] James Fraser of Brea, "Memories of James Fraser of Brea," in *Select Bibliographies*, ed. W. K. Tweedie, (Edinburgh, 1845), 2:89–370.

[2] Ibid., 103.

[3] Ibid., 106.

This language of Satan's overwhelming presence pervades Fraser's memoirs. Even eventual confidence in his election did not bring spiritual ease. At various times, he believed that he "smellest already of hell," referred to himself as "a bitter enemy to God, and a toad full of poison and venom," and even wrote that he had "devil in him."[4] Far from unique, such language appears frequently in the spiritual diaries, sermons, and theological works of Reformed Protestant Scots.

Beliefs about the Devil informed Scottish piety in a myriad of ways. Personal, internalized struggles with Satan existed on a spectrum; they could serve as a hopeful metric of one's godliness or as a trenchant reminder of the natural depravity of postlapsarian man. Though the experiential reality of the Devil usually fell between these extremes, the bleaker, despairing end of the spectrum often prevailed. This article focuses on this dark side of demonic struggles as revealed in the writings of godly Scots able and inclined to record their religious beliefs and experiences. It identifies a process of profound anxiety and self-identification as evil that occurred during introspective, personal engagement with Satan, which I have loosely coined "internalizing the demonic." This process reveals the close and consequential relationship between the clerical promotion of self-surveillance and the widely internalized belief in the Devil's natural affinity with the "evil hearts" of men and women.

In the last few decades, the Devil has been ushered to the forefront of early modern historiography.[5] The experiential relationship between Reformed theology, the clerical promotion of self-examination and demonic belief, however, has yet to be fully examined, not least in the context of Scotland.[6] While historians have conducted illuminating studies of the place of the Devil in early modern England, their arguments and research have remained confined to national boundaries.[7] Yet just as political historians of early modern Britain have embraced J. G. A. Pocock's decades-old call for British history that is transnational and inclusive, historians of British cultural and religious history have increasingly begun to look beyond borders to better understand how ways of believing and behaving developed and evolved across time and

[4] Ibid., 116, 122, and 103.

[5] Studies of the Devil and demonology in early modern Europe, outside of the context of witchcraft, include Stuart Clark, *Thinking with Demons: The Idea of Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe* (Oxford, 1997); Jonathan Pearl, *The Crime of Crimes: Demonology and Politics in France, 1560–1620* (Waterloo, Ontario, 1999); Fernando Cervantes, *The Devil in the New World: The Impact of Diabolism in New Spain* (New Haven, CT, 1994); Jeffrey B. Russell, *Lucifer: The Devil in the Middle Ages* (Ithaca, NY, 1984); Jeffrey B. Russell, *Mephistopheles: The Devil in the Modern World* (Ithaca, NY, 1986).

[6] Previous studies of the Devil in Scotland have focused almost exclusively on witchcraft. See, for example, Joyce Miller, "Men in Black: Appearances of the Devil in Early Modern Scottish Witchcraft Discourse," in *Witchcraft and Belief in Early Modern Scotland*, ed. Julian Goodare, Lauren Martin, and Joyce Miller (Basingstoke, 2008), 144–65; Edward Cowen, "Witch Persecution and Popular Belief in Lowland Scotland: The Devil's Decade," in *Witchcraft and Belief*, ed. Goodare, Martin, and Miller, 71–94; Laura Martin, "The Devil and the Domestic: Witchcraft, Quarrels and Women's Work in Scotland," in *The Scottish Witch-Hunt in Context,* ed. Julian Goodare (Manchester, 2002), 73–89; and Stuart MacDonald, "In Search of the Devil in Fife," ed. Goodare, 33–50. For a recent survey of Scottish witch-hunting, see Brian Levack, *Witch-Hunting in Scotland: Law, Politics and Religion* (New York, 2008).

[7] Nathan Johnstone, *The Devil and Demonism in Early Modern England* (Cambridge, 2006); Nathan Johnstone, "The Protestant Devil: The Experience of Temptation in Early Modern England," *Journal of British Studies* 43, no. 2 (2004): 173–205; Frank Luttmer, "Prosecutors, Tempters and Vassals of the Devil: The Unregenerate in Puritan Practical Divinity," *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 51, no. 1 (2000): 37–68; Darren Oldridge, *The Devil in Early Modern England* (Sutton, 2000). There is now a revised edition of Oldridge's book, *The Devil in Tudor and Stuart England* (Stroud, 2010).

space.[8] The study of Satan demands the same approach. The goal of this article, then, is first to explore the development and expression of demonic beliefs and experiences in Scottish self-writings. Second, through examination of the circulation of English texts in Scotland and brief comparison with Reformed communities in England, it aims to demonstrate how transnational discussions of sin, Satan, and human nature informed personal religious experience.

The role played by Satan in the internal world of Scottish piety might also be viewed as an instantiation of the broader relationship between demonic beliefs, lived religion, and Reformed Protestantism. The demonic experiences of Scots appear to have been unique not in kind, but in degree and frequency. Though the break with Rome was neither seamless nor absolute, in 1560 the Scottish people experienced a comparatively peaceful, thorough, and lasting Reformation.[9] In the decades to follow, Scotland became a bulwark of Reformed Protestantism and would remain so for much of the seventeenth century and beyond.[10] As Alasdair Raffe has recently demonstrated, after the Restoration some Episcopalians began to reject the orthodox Calvinist emphasis on sin and salvation, as well as the highly introspective piety of their Presbyterian counterparts.[11] This, however, did little to alter the demonic experiences of the Scottish people—at least those who recorded their ideas about and personal struggles with the Devil. Well into the early eighteenth century many Scots continued to articulate a deep and anxious concern for the Devil's involvement in their internal lives, though their emphasis on strict predestinarianism seems to have declined. This lasting focus on Satan, within the context of a Reformed community awash in apocalyptic anticipation, makes Scotland emblematic of the more general and often dramatic relationship between the Devil and Protestant piety.

TERMINOLOGY

The term "internalizing the demonic," used throughout this article, is an imprecise one. Here "demonic" is used to connote a spectrum of ideas about the Devil, his involvement in earthly affairs, and his relation to humankind—ideas that were often

[8] J. G. A. Pocock, "British History: A Plea for a New Subject," *Journal of Modern History* 47, no. 4 (1975): 601–21. A few recent examples of this inclusive British approach are Alec Ryrie, *Being Protestant in Reformation Britain* (Oxford, 2013); Alexandra Walsham, *The Reformation of the Landscape: Religion, Identity and Memory in Early Modern Britain and Ireland* (Oxford, 2011); Rab Houston, *Punishing the Dead: Suicide, Lordship, and Community in Britain, 1500–1800* (Oxford, 2010); Claire Kellar, *Scotland, England, and the Reformation, 1534–1561* (Oxford, 2004).

[9] For a discussion of the nature of the Scottish Reformation from an international perspective, see Philip Benedict, *Christ's Church Purely Reformed: A Social History of Calvinism* (New Haven, CT, 2002), 152–72; Michael Lynch, "Calvinism in Scotland, 1559–1638," in *International Calvinism, 1541–1715*, ed. Menna Preswich (Oxford, 1985), 225–56; and Michael Graham, "The Civil Sword and the Scottish Kirk, 1560–1600," in *Later Calvinism: International Perspectives*, ed. W. Fred Graham (Kirksville, MO, 1994), 237–66.

[10] For a study of the immediate course of the Reformation, see Jane Dawson, *Scotland Re-formed, 1488–1587* (Edinburgh, 2007). For a ground-breaking study of the influence of the Reformation on ordinary Scots, see Margo Todd, *The Culture of Protestantism in Early Modern Scotland* (New Haven, CT, 2002). A good local study of the aftermath Reformation and the complexity of Protestant success in Scotland is John McCallum, *Reforming the Scottish Parish: The Reformation in Fife, 1560–1640* (Aldershot, 2010).

[11] Alasdair Raffe, *The Culture of Controversy: Religious Arguments in Scotland, 1660–1714* (Woodbridge, 2012). On political and religious debates in Restoration Scotland more broadly, see Clare Jackson, *Restoration Scotland, 1660–1690: Royalist Politics, Religion, and Ideas* (Woodbridge, 2003).

internalized by Scottish men and women anxious about their sinful selves and the possibility of eternal damnation. In internalizing the demonic, Scots conceived of themselves primarily as deserving recipients of intrusions and assaults by Satan rather than as active agents of their own religious experiences. This neither means that these demonic struggles were not purposeful or purposely constructed in Scottish piety, nor that the despair that attended them could not bear fruit. On the contrary, the recognition of sinfulness and even the self-identification as evil served as preconditions for submission to God, conversion experiences, and entrance into the community of the elect.[12] Yet internalizing the demonic remained a mostly painful and passive process, the result of clerical and cultural discussions of Satan and self-examination that were intended, as Louise Yeoman has put it, "to convince men that their everyday selves were irremediably evil."[13] In the religious experiences of the godly in Scotland and beyond, internal struggles against the Devil were intimately bound up with the anguished recognition of one's evil nature and spiritual impotence.

The process of internalizing the demonic is revealed primarily through "self-writings"—the range of first-person, usually autobiographical, writings, including letters, spiritual diaries, memoirs, and personal covenants—composed by an influential minority of literate Scots.[14] Though these men and women experienced Satan according to individual personalities and histories, this process usually entailed four distinct phases. First, Reformed Scots clergy promoted the necessity of introspection—an idea predicated on human depravity—from the pulpit and in print. Second, the godly (or would-be godly) placed their thoughts, words, and deeds, past and present, under intense scrutiny. More often than not, this introspection involved the perception of assaults by Satan and the recollection, at the Devil's prodding, of past transgressions. Third, during these internal struggles against the Devil, the godly would begin to self-identify as evil or even demonic, feeling helpless, hopeless, and sometimes suicidal.[15] Last, and only through the mercy of divine intervention following moments of prayer and beseeching, this period of internalizing the demonic would come to an end.

This process was neither guaranteed nor homogenous. Just as Reformed theology contained remarkable diversity over time and space, so too did the demonic experiences of the godly, even amongst the zealous Protestants that populated the Anglophone world.[16] Some Scots simply recognized the presence of demonically induced

[12] On the potential spiritual benefits of despair, see Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, chapter 2.

[13] Louise Yeoman, "Heart-Work: Emotion, Empowerment and Authority in Covenanting Times" (Ph.D. diss., University of St. Andrews, 1991), 11.

[14] For a thorough analysis of the genre of self-writing in Scotland, see David Mullan, *Narratives of the Religious Self in Early-Modern Scotland* (London, 2010). On literacy in Scotland, see Rab Houston, "The Literacy Myth? Illiteracy in Scotland, 1630–1760," *Past and Present* 96, no. 1 (1982): 81–102 (89–91).

[15] On suicide in Scotland, see Houston, *Punishing the Dead*, especially 292–312. For other works on the relationship between suicide and Reformed Protestantism, see *From Sin to Insanity: Suicide in Early Modern Europe*, ed. Jeffery Watt (Ithaca, NY, 2004); and Michael MacDonald and Terence Murphy, *Sleepless Souls: Suicide in Early Modern England* (Oxford, 1991).

[16] For a discussion of both shared theological foundations as well as schisms within Reformed Protestantism in Britain and on the Continent, see, for example, Richard Muller, "John Calvin and Later Calvinism," in *The Cambridge Companion to Reformation Theology*, ed. David V. N. Bagchi and David Curtis

doubts, while others became suicidal at the thought of their own reprobation. These experiential differences were deeply informed by both personal proclivities and specific communal expectations. This diversity of experience notwithstanding, Scottish men and women actively drew from a "shared pool of cultural meanings" about the Devil, a pool deeply shaped by the ideas about human sin and predestined salvation promoted from the pulpit.[17] Throughout this article, the labels "Reformed Protestant" and "godly" have been employed to indicate those individuals in Scotland and throughout the Anglophone world whose religious views and self-identification placed them in this zealous Protestant camp.[18] Terms such as "Presbyterian" and "Puritan" have been avoided, as these, at least for much of the early modern period, conveyed distinctions of politics rather than piety.[19]

THE DEVIL REFORMED

At the heart of internalizing the demonic lay the theology and practice of Reformed Protestantism. For many Scots, the Reformed faith entailed, in both theory and in exercise, a complex and often anxious process of questioning the self. This internal questioning stemmed from a potent mix of ideas about the Devil, innate depravity, and double predestination (the doctrine that God has foreordained both those who will be saved and those who will be damned). The collision of these doctrines with experiential struggles against Satan caused the self-identified godly in Scotland, in moments of intense scrutiny, to believe the very worst: that they were irrevocably evil, even demonic, and destined for an eternity in hell.

The findings here concur with numerous studies that have traced the development of a distinctly Protestant demonology focused primarily on the intrusion of the Devil into one's internal life. As Nathan Johnstone has argued, for many Protestants, the Devil's power "to enter directly into consciousness" became the "archetype of his agency."[20] Though profoundly physical consequences sometimes attended demonic experiences, temptation and subversion became Satan's greatest weapons. This does not mean, however, that the adoption of Reformed Protestantism during the Scottish Reformation occasioned the abandonment of medieval ideas about Satan or the production of a new, exclusively Protestant demonology. The continued corporeality of the Devil in cases of Scottish witchcraft attests to the

Steinmetz (Cambridge, 2004), 130–49; Benedict, *Christ's Church* , 293–423; and *Drawn into Controversie: Reformed Theological Diversity and Debates within Seventeenth-Century British Puritanism*, ed. Michael Haykin and Mark Jones (Göttingen, 2011).

[17] This phrase is Annabel Gregory's, in "Witchcraft, Politics and 'Good Neighborhood' in Early Seventeenth Century Rye," *Past and Present* 133, no. 1 (1991): 31–66 (52).

[18] The choice of the label "Reformed Protestant" over "Calvinist" reflects both historical accuracy and historiographical consensus. See Philip Benedict, *Christ's Church Purely Reformed: A Social History of Calvinism* (New Haven, CT, 2002), especially xxii–xxiii.

[19] On religious terminology in early modern Scotland and England, see John Coffey, "The Problem of 'Scottish Puritanism,' 1590–1638," in *Enforcing Reformation in Ireland and Scotland, 1550–1700*, ed. Elizabeth Boran and Crawford Gribben (Aldershot, 2006), 66–90; and Peter Marshall, "The Naming of Protestant England," *Past and Present* 214, no. 1 (2012): 87–128.

[20] Johnstone, "The Protestant Devil," 177.

coexistence of a range of conceptions of Satan.[21] Certainly, as a number of historians have correctly pointed out, Catholic and Protestant demonologies had many similarities, thanks to, among other things, a shared Augustinian heritage and the mutual reliance on Scripture.[22] These important similarities notwithstanding, the introduction of Protestantism to Scotland produced a set of beliefs about and self-conscious experiences of the Devil predicated upon the Reformed emphases on total human depravity and predestination. Despite important debates over theology and ecclesiology, both within and beyond Scottish borders, the embrace of ideas about salvation and sin proved formative in shaping how many Scots understood the Devil and themselves.[23]

The relationship between Satan and predestinarian theology, yet to be thoroughly unpacked by historians, raises a perplexing yet crucial question about the Devil's role in the Reformed Protestant world: If Satan could never alter salvation, then how does one explain the intense preoccupation with demonic temptation and subversion that plagued many Protestants in Scotland and beyond? Partly, the concern for and vigilance against Satan were driven by the pervasive desire among the godly to purify themselves and the world around them. The Scottish Reformation, like Reformations elsewhere in Europe, provoked a renewed interest in Satan's earthly activities and his relationship to mankind that was hastened by growing apocalyptic fervor.[24] The long shadow cast by the Apocalypse, which many believed to be imminent, heightened the preoccupation with the Devil's actions. As Revelation 20:7–10 foretold, Satan would be loosed from his chain in hell during the Last Days. To those who viewed the world through this eschatological lens, evidence of demonic activity and the need to combat it seemed more abundant and urgent than ever. In Scotland, this apocalyptic vision of society propelled Satan into a central role in the internal religious experiences of the godly.[25]

Moreover, double predestination, espoused from pulpits throughout early modern Scotland, taught that God alone possessed knowledge of an individual's impending afterlife. Within the Reformed tradition, of course, thoughts about predestination differed in terms of presentation and precise definition. Nonetheless, as Richard Muller has argued, "the basic premise of the doctrine, whether formulated as a single or double decree or in infra- or supralapsarian terms, is that salvation rests

[21] On appearances of Satan in cases of witchcraft, see Miller, "Men in Black."

[22] See, for example, Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, *Puritan Conquistadors: Iberianizing the Atlantic, 1550–1700* (Stanford, 2006); Clark, *Thinking with Demons*, especially 526–45; Stuart Clark, "Protestant Demonology: Sin, Superstition and Society," in *Early Modern European Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*, ed. Bengt Ankarloo and Gustav Henningsen (Oxford, 1990), 45–82.

[23] For further discussion of religious and political debates in post-Reformation Scotland, especially prior to the Restoration in 1660, see especially the works of David G. Mullan: "Theology in the Church of Scotland, 1618–1640: A Calvinist Consensus?," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 26, no. 3 (1995): 595–617; *Episcopacy in Scotland: the History of an Idea, 1560–1638* (Edinburgh, 1986); *Scottish Puritanism, 1590–1638* (Oxford, 2000). For an examination of the dissolution of theological consensus after 1660, see Raffe, *The Culture of Controversy.*

[24] On apocalyptic thought in post-Reformation Britain, see John Coffey, "The Impact of Apocalypticism during the Puritan Revolutions," *Perichoresis* 4, no. 2 (2006): 117–47; Katharine R. Firth, *The Apocalyptic Tradition in Reformation Britain, 1530–1645* (Oxford, 1979); Arthur Williamson, *Scottish National Consciousness in the Age of James VI: The Apocalypse, the Union, and the Shaping of Scotland's Public Culture* (Edinburgh, 1979).

[25] See Williamson, *Scottish National Consciousness*, especially 48–63.

on the free and sovereign elect of God and damnation results from human sin."[26] Some assurance of faith might be gained through a conversion experience, but election remained ultimately and frustratingly unknowable. In the search for assurance amidst this unknowability, active resistance against Satan was often perceived not only as an inherent duty, but also a metric of one's predetermined election.[27] The real threat posed by the Devil thus did not lie at the end of salvation but rather on the journey to it, during which interactions with Satan would exploit not only anxiety over salvation, but also struggles with one's innately depraved nature.[28] The internalization of these theological ideas lent the Devil primacy of place in the personal religious experiences of many Scots.

SATAN AND SELF-EXAMINATION

Scottish divines predicated their encouragement of introspection, especially in the face of demonic assaults, on the belief in the innate and total depravity of all men and women, elect and reprobate alike. This obsession with human sin, which invariably directed theological and pastoral discussions of Satan, assumed extreme forms in the Reformed communities of Scotland. Here, warnings about the Devil—found in sermons, theological writings, spiritual diaries, and pamphlet literature, among other sources—frequently coincided with remarks about man's evil heart and the attending need for self-examination and continued surveillance. Many Scots, accordingly, considered their naturally evil thoughts to be as bad as the performance of evil deeds.[29]

This led, for the godly, to an intense desire to control their inner worlds. Such control would require not only self-examination, but also constant self-surveillance. It was not enough to recognize past sin; future evils needed prevention as well. This was a daunting task, for it was concurrently asserted from the pulpit that the depravity of man rendered such control impossible. At the same time, Scottish divines stressed that though their audiences could not adequately and independently fulfill the laws of God, this was no excuse for not attempting to do so.

This focus on the sinfulness of humanity and the need for self-examination and surveillance had a long heritage. Saint Augustine of Hippo had considered human behavior to be the ultimate evidence of Satan's presence in the world, more than

[26] Richard Muller, *After Calvin: Studies in the Development of a Theological Tradition* (Oxford, 2003), 12. For a further discussion of the development of predestination theology and the Reformation, see Muller, *Christ and the Decree: Christology and Predestination in Reformed Theology from Calvin to Perkins* (Grand Rapids, MI, 1988), 79–96.

[27] Johnstone, *Devil and Demonism*, 3. Alec Ryrie also discusses the importance of combating the Devil through prayer as an essential component of this godly path. Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, 243–47.

[28] Scholars have long recognized the psychological consequences of emphasis on the doctrine of predestination. John Stachniewski has argued that Puritanism's uncompromising focus on predestination and damnation isolated its less confident adherents because they worried that their experience of despair would be interpreted by the godly as a sign of reprobation. See Stachniewski, *The Persecutory Imagination: English Puritanism and the Literature of Religious Despair* (Oxford, 1991), 17–61. This portrayal of predestination has been recently and persuasively critiqued by Leif Dixon, who argues that the doctrine, at least in its presentation, was intended to provide comfort to parishioners. See Leif Dixon, *Practical Predestinarians in England, 1590–1640* (London, 2014).

[29] Yeoman, "Heart-Work," especially 7–11.

any general mischance or misfortune.[30] Like Augustine, John Calvin ruminated about demonic activity primarily because of its connection to the sinfulness of all men and women. Even the elect, he wrote, remained subject to "the flesh, the world, and the devil" because they were "besprinkled only with a few drops by the Spirit."[31] This Augustinian heritage profoundly shaped how those in the early modern Anglophone world understood the nature of humanity. As the English clergyman John Downame wrote in 1634, all progeny of Adam were "made backward unto all good, and prone unto all evill."[32] Even children, many Reformed Protestants averred, were totally corrupted "limbs of Satan."[33] In his farewell community address given in the early eighteenth century, Thomas Locke, a Scottish schoolteacher, warned of the susceptibility of children to Satan's wiles. "Are there not some children," he implored, who "before they can well speak they have the devill in their mouth? . . . By nature we are of our father the devil, and his works we will do as natively as fire casteth forth heat."[34] The only means of combating such innately depraved tendencies, these divines avowed, was through extreme self-examination and surveillance. It was during this intense introspection that internalizing the demonic occurred.

The English pastoral tradition spread the focus on self-examination north of the border in printed sermons and devotional guides.[35] The practice of diary keeping in England began in the 1580s and 1590s, thanks to its promotion by the Protestant divine William Perkins. The keeping of spiritual diaries proliferated in England in the early seventeenth century, when Protestants of the staunchly Calvinist ilk increasingly found themselves in the minority and sought to record their experiences in the face of persecution.[36] This practice spread to Scotland a few decades later and would hasten during the religious upheaval created by the Restoration, as many covenanting Scots took up the pen in hopes of documenting their struggles, finding solace in writing, and providing example for others.[37]

Perkins, as the most frequently reprinted English author between 1590 and 1620, became the wellspring for much of Reformed Protestant thinking throughout the Anglophone world. His ideas—particularly his focus on predestination and the necessity of introspection—found quick acceptance in post-Reformation Scotland. Here, the Perkins brand of practical, reflective divinity undoubtedly influenced the composition of self-writings, a genre to which the Scots appended their particular

[30] On this point, see Hans Peter Broedel, *The Malleus Maleficarum and the Construction of Witchcraft* (Manchester, 2003), 47. In particular, Augustine's *Confessions* (written AD 397–398) provided the model for examining and recording the sins of one's past in a systematic way.

[31] John Calvin, *Commentaries on the Epistle of Paul the Apostle to the Romans* (1539), trans. John Owen (Edinburgh, 1849), 308.

[32] John Downame, *The Christian Warfare* (London, 1634), 1041.

[33] Strachniewski, *Persecutory Imagination*, 97–98.

[34] Thomas Locke, "To the parents of the children of Eastwood," ca. 1706, National Library of Scotland (hereafter NLS) Wod. Qu. LXXXII, fol. 159.

[35] On the tradition of Puritan self-examination, see Margo Todd, *Christian Humanism and the Puritan Social Order* (Cambridge, 1987), 30–31 and 192–95.

[36] Owen C. Watkins lists 220 titles of English autobiographical works up to 1725 in his bibliography to *The Puritan Experience: Studies in Spiritual Autobiography* (New York, 1972).

[37] Mullan, *Narratives of the Religious Self*, lx.

focus on covenanting.[38] Perkins' *A Case of Conscience* was printed in Edinburgh as well as London in 1592. In it, he recognized the fears propagated by the doctrine of predestination, and to this end he advised his readers that they must confess their sins in order to experience any sense of salvation.[39] As he penned in his influential catechism, "all men are wholly corrupted with in through Adam's fall, and so are become slaves of Satan."[40] Closeness to God could only be achieved through recognition and confession of this innate depravity.

Another English devotional guide that left its mark on Scottish piety was Lewis Bayly's *Practice of Piety, Directing the Christian how to walk that he may please God*.[41] Originally written in 1611, *Practice of Piety* was perhaps the most popular devotional guide in England during the first half of the seventeenth century. It was reprinted in Scotland at least six times between 1630 and 1667, and it is very likely that copies from London circulated in Scotland prior to these dates.[42] *Practice of Piety* encouraged, in a systematic way, the introspective process that could lead to internalizing the demonic. As Bayly wrote in his introduction, first man had to know God, and then to know his own "state of Corruption." "And forasmuch as there can be no true piety without the knowledge of God," he explained, nor could there exist "any good practice without the knowledge of a man's own self."[43] Bayly went on to compare the glories of God's election with the terrible state of those individuals who lived without redemption, whom he described as existing for eternity in a "bottomless lake of utter darkness" where the reprobate would "always weap for the paine of the fire, and yet gnash [their] teeth for the extremity of the cold."[44] The works of English divines such as Perkins and Bayly were intended not only to encourage readers to recognize and record their own depravity, but also to equip them with the necessary tools—in the form of prayer and general devotion—to combat the inevitable temptations of Satan.

PREACHING ON SATAN, SIN, AND SCRUTINY

These English devotional works accorded with the sermons of Scottish ministers, who encouraged introspection through recurrent discussions of human wickedness and the need for self-surveillance.[45] One mid-century minister described the

[38] Benedict, *Christ's Church* , 521–22. On the practice of covenanting in Scotland, see *Protestant Piety in Early Modern Scotland: Letters, Lives and Covenants, 1650–1712*, ed. David Mullan (Edinburgh, 2008), and Mullan, *Narratives of the Religious Self*.

[39] William Perkins, *A Case of Conscience, the greatest that euer was; how a man may know whether he be the child of God or no* (London, 1592).

[40] William Perkins, *The Foundation of Christian Religion Gathered Into Six Principles* (1591; repr., London, 1641), 16.

[41] Lewis Bayly, *Practice of Piety, Directing the Christian how to walk that he may please God* (London, 1611).

[42] According to Early English Books Online, *Practice of Piety* was printed in Edinburgh twice in 1630 and in 1636, 1642, 1649, and 1667, long after Bayly's death in 1631.

[43] Bayly, *Practice of Piety*, 1.

[44] Ibid., 64–65.

[45] The clerical emphasis on self-surveillance and inner piety in seventeenth-century Scotland has been explored by Louise Yeoman in her excellent Ph.D. thesis. See Yeoman, "Heart-Work." On preaching in the Reformed Protestant tradition more broadly, see James Thomas Ford, "Preaching in the Reformed Tradition," in *Preachers and People in the Reformations and Early Modern Europe*, ed. Larissa Taylor (Leiden, 2001): 65–88.

tyranny of man's "original and natural corruption" as a "universall disease and poyson runing throw, and infecting both the utter and iner man, defiling all the faculties of our souls, and members of our bodies."[46] To combat this innate tendency towards evil, the Glasgow minister Andrew Gray preached that "Christians should be full of eyes within to examine themselves and to see their own corruptions. There are many who have eyes without to take notice of other peoples carriage, but they have no eyes to look within to themselves."[47] The sermonic focus on internal weakness championed among parishioners an introspective turn that ministers hoped would result in a more pious, self-aware population. As John Welch of Ayr, son-in-law of the famed Reformer John Knox, bluntly preached in the early seventeenth century, "the book of your conscience must be opened or you will go to Hell."[48] Even James VI and I took heed. In his advice to his son, the future king Charles I, he included this telling (and, in hindsight, ironic) verse: "Looke to your selves, what Conscience you have; For Conscience shall damne, and Conscience shall save."[49]

To this end, the Devil was a favorite topic of Scottish ministers, who intertwined their discussions of the powers of Satan with the understanding of humankind as irrevocably debased. In a sermon delivered in 1591, Robert Bruce described how demonic temptation could manifest itself in a variety of tangible and intangible ways, all of which collaborated with preexisting human corruption. As he put it, Satan "insinuates himself in our affections by reason of the corruption that is in us."[50] Alexander Henderson preached in 1638 that "if [it] so be that we had a right heart, then Satan nor his temptations would not prevail over us. But it is a pitiful thing that he has darts, and shoots them at poor souls, and we are ready to receive them, and then we cannot get them out again."[51] Satan did not just prey on individual spiritual weakness; human frailty provided both the impetus and the means for demonic assaults. As the covenanting minister Robert Baillie warned the Presbytery of Irvine, men must "pray to God for our cause and Church: God will help us against all, men and devills: No man is to be trusted; the best is naturallie false."[52] In highlighting innate depravity in the context of experiences with Satan, Scottish clergymen encouraged their audiences to recognize their absolute dependence on God.

Like their Scottish counterparts, Reformed preachers in England sought to convince their parishioners of their "wretched state by nature"—a phrase common in sermons throughout the Anglophone world—and the attending need for introspection.[53] In an evocative mid-century treatise on Revelation, John Cotton cautioned his

[46] Seventeenth-century sermons, ca. 1655, National Archives of Scotland (hereafter NAS), MS 5769, 133.

[47] Andrew Gray, *Directions and instigations to the duty of prayer how, and why the heart is to be kept with diligence* (Edinburgh, 1669), fol. 113.

[48] John Welch, *Forty-Eight Select Sermons* (Edinburgh, 1744), 66.

[49] James VI and I, *The fathers blessing, or, counsaile to his sonne* (London, 1624), 30. Originally published in 1616. Though James VI and I is cited as the author, it should be noted that *The fathers blessing* was an anonymously written adaptation of *Basilikon doron*, 1599.

[50] Robert Bruce, *Sermons*, ed. William Cunningham (Edinburgh, 1843), 389.

[51] Alexander Henderson, *Sermons, Prayers and Pulpit Addresses of Alexander Henderson,* ed. Thomas R. Martin (Edinburgh, 1867), 215.

[52] Robert Baillie, *The Letters and Journals of Robert Baillie, 1637–1662*, ed. David Laing (Edinburgh, 1841), 1:350.

[53] Luttmer, "Prosecutors, Tempters and Vassals of the Devil," 39.

fellow believers against spiritual confidence or complacency against Satan: "the Devil, you say you defie him, and did renounce him in Baptisme . . . But if there were not a strong power of Satan in us, how comes it that the blood of Christ must be shed, to destroy him that had the power of death."[54] Such sentiments were likewise promoted across Scotland and internalized by anxious parishioners. One example comes from an anonymous late seventeenth-century diary, whose eighteen year-old author wrote of his shame when contemplating the errors of his past: "All my sins were laid before me. . . . My whole life was like ane act of sin, and that Hell was to receive me I said that I have deserved the hottest place in it. . . . I have nothing that was good in me, a poor sinfull creature, what is there in me that God should pardon me?"[55] In the eyes of many like-minded Scots, the main difference between them and Satan lay not in any innate goodness, but in the death of Christ, who gave humankind a chance at redemption.

Perhaps the most interesting element of Reformed sermons on human corruption was the insinuation, implicit or explicit, that Satan was actually *within* men and women. From the pulpit, Scottish preachers frequently used the language of the Devil being inside the individual hearts and minds of men and women, a presence against which they must constantly battle. In a 1589 sermon, Robert Bruce told his audience that they must be vigilant, "for we have to do with principalities and powers, with spiritual wickedness, which are above us and within us also. For he is not that has corruption within him, but Sathan is in him; So we cannot be half walkrife [wakeful], ever studying to cast out the devill, to renounce our selfs, and to submit to the obedience of Christ."[56] Alexander Hume echoed these words in a late sixteenth-century treatise on the human conscience when he wrote that "the devil was never lother to come out of the person whom he possesseth, nor naturall vices will be to come out of mans hart, where they have once taken deepe root."[57]As Andrew Gray lamented in 1628, "I think many of us may be afraid that the devil dwels and keeps possession in many of our hearts, and alace! He is like to be a possessor of some of them perpetually."[58] Samuel Rutherford couched this internal presence of the Devil in horticultural terms, stating that "Satan findeth his own Seed in us by Nature."[59] James Durham, minister of Glasgow, wrote about this internal demonic presence in his wonderfully titled sermon, "The great corruption of subtile self, discovered, and driven from it's lurking-places and starting-holes."[60]

The presence of the Devil within rendered the battle against evil both an internal as well as external one. As John Welch explained, "the godly, because God and the devil, light and darkness, righteousness and unrighteousness, a Jacob and an Esau are

[54] John Cotton, *An exposition upon the thirteenth chapter of the Revelation* (London, 1656). Delivered around 1639.

[55] Religious diary, 1679–1692, NAS, Ch12/20/9, fols. 5–6.

[56] Bruce, *Sermons*, 23–24.

[57] Alexander Hume, *Ane treatise of conscience Quhairin divers secreits concerning that subiect, are discovered, as may appeare, in the table following* (Edinburgh, 1594), 57.

[58] Gray, *Directions and instigations*, 106.

[59] Samuel Rutherford, "Sermon V," *The Trial and Triumph of Faith* (Edinburgh, 1645), 43.

[60] James Durham, *The great corruption of subtile self, discovered, and driven from it's lurking-places and starting-holes* (Edinburgh, 1686). This was probably delivered mid-century in Glasgow, where Durham was minister.

within them, therefore they cannot be without warfare."[61] Gray echoed this duality when he told listeners that "a man that hath two hearts, a part of his heart goeth to God, and a part of his heart goeth to the devil."[62] Such language was not unique to Scotland. In England, Thomas Goodwin wrote that "a man's heart is like those two-faced pictures, if you looke one way, you shall see nothing but some horrid shapre of a devil, or the like; but go to the otherside . . . and you shall see the picture of an Angell."[63] Time and again, Reformed clergymen described the opposition and contrariety usually reserved for the demonization of others in a profoundly personal, internal way.[64]

Did these preachers actually mean that Satan was *within* the hearts of postlapsarian men and women, or were they using the Devil to connote evil and corruptions more symbolically? According to Reformed theology, the Devil and human corruption both existed and operated in tandem. Reformed Protestant theologians, most notably the Swiss Reformer and friend of Calvin, Pierre Viret, had long articulated the idea that all human beings, due to their innate depravity, were possessed by the Devil.[65] The implantation and enactment of sin was, after all, Satan's greatest weapon, and people had sinfulness in spades. As such, it is possible that some Scottish divines would have indeed averred that the actual presence of Satan could be found in the hearts and minds of the elect and reprobate alike. This was not, of course, the type of physical, total possession that overtook a very small number of demoniacs—only eleven in total—in Scotland at the turn of the seventeenth century.[66] Yet due to their innate sinfulness, demonic possession was, in a spiritually inherent sense, a constant component of the lives of all men and women. To many Scottish clergymen, it seemed that demonic forces resided in the human heart in an ongoing attempt to remove any drops of goodness from postlapsarian man.

INTERNALIZING THE DEMONIC

Given this sermonic emphasis, it is hardly surprising that in their self-writings many Scots identified their own depravity and Satan as intimate bedfellows. After months, years, and even decades of hearing about human depravity and the necessity of self-surveillance from the pulpit, many Scots became acutely aware of—and sometimes obsessed with—their own sinfulness. Satan, and his ability to impede any spiritual progress or peace, served as a trenchant reminder of personal frailty and failings.

[61] Welch, *Forty-Eight Select Sermons*, 144.

[62] Gray, *Directions and instigations,* 95.

[63] Thomas Goodwin, *Childe of Light Walking in Darknes, or, a Treatise Shewing the Causes, by which the Cases, wherein the Ends, for which God Leaves his Children to Distresse of Conscience* (London, 1636), 193.

[64] On the tradition of the demonization of external enemies, especially in the medieval period, see, for example, R. I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society* (New York, 1987), 64–65, 89–91; Norman Cohn, *Europe's Inner Demons: The Demonization of Christians in Medieval Christendom*, rev. ed. (Chicago, 2001), 16–59; Elaine Pagels, *The Origin of Satan* (London, 1996), xvii. On the oppositional language of Satan, see Clark, *Thinking with Demons* .

[65] On this point, see Brian P. Levack, *The Devil Within: Possession and Exorcism in the Christian West* (New Haven, CT, 2013), 19.

[66] Levack, *Witch-Hunting in Scotland*, 115–30; Brian P. Levack, "Demonic Possession in Early Modern Scotland," in Goodare, Martin, and Miller, *Witchcraft and Belief*, 166–84.

In moments of compulsive introspection, these godly men and women began to fear that they were, due to their "evil hearts," in league with the Devil, even themselves demonic, and beyond the pale of salvation. Some began to feel that Satan was within them, a likely consequence of the sermonic rhetoric discussed above. The self-writings of Reformed Scots thus reveal the profound effect that demonic belief, paired with the promotion of self-examination, could have on how early modern men and women understood themselves and their place in the cosmos.

It bears noting from the outset that the writings revealing the process of internalizing the demonic are fraught with problems for the historian hoping to sort fact from fiction. Members of the Reformed Protestant faith generally presented their lives, and indeed their encounters with Satan, in a very self-conscious and stylized way. They tried to fashion themselves as the deserving godly they hoped to be. As David Mullan has argued, in Scottish spiritual narratives "self-imagining is very much part of the story—the genre depends upon a strong sense of the self as worthy of exemplification, or at least as representing a story worth telling, under the watchful eyes of a holy God."[67] Yet even if such demonic encounters were purposefully constructed, these spiritual accounts nonetheless illustrate what educated early modern men and women believed—and indeed felt, sometimes with great terror—about themselves and Satan's involvement in their hearts and souls. Moreover, the patterns in and expectations of such demonic experiences are themselves revealing of how Reformed Scots felt they should perceive and present themselves and their inner lives.

One particularly illustrative example of Scottish demonic experiences comes from the narrative of Mistress Rutherford, a young woman who in the early seventeenth century chronicled the spiritual experiences that had dominated her life.[68] Orphaned early in life and raised in Edinburgh by her strict grandparents, she was from her youth plagued by a profound fear of Satan. This demonic apprehension was so consuming that she suffered insomnia and even suicidal thoughts: "I could not sleep for fear of him. . . . Many a time wished I for wars to come into the kingdom, that I might have been slain so being that I had been guilt of doing it myself."[69] Later in life, Rutherford wrote that the Devil convinced her that she had committed the sin against the Holy Ghost—an unforgivable, eternal sin by which salvation becomes impossible.[70] Tormented by guilt and fear at this thought, she again considered suicide, writing that "Satan tempted me to put violence hands in my self, making me think it so far from sin, that it would be looked on as good service to God to execut his justice on such a traitor."[71] For Mistress Rutherford, who had

[67] Mullan, *Narratives of the Religious Self*, 8.

[68] Mistress Rutherford, "Mistress Rutherford's Conversion Narrative," in *Miscellany of the Scottish History Society*, vol. 13, ed. David Mullan (Edinburgh, 2004), 146–88.

[69] Ibid., 153. R. A Houston discusses the suicidal thoughts of Mistress Rutherford in *Punishing the Dead?*, 309–10.

[70] Some sins frequently considered eternal include the deliberate rejection of the mercy of God and ascribing the work of the Holy Spirit to the Devil. The basis for belief in eternal sins comes from Matthew 12:30–32. The sin against the Holy Spirit, which Calvin, Beza, James VI, and many other theologians addressed, was the one sure sign that an individual was reprobate. On this point, see, for example, John Calvin, *A harmonie vpon the three Euangelists, Matthew, Mark and Luke* (London, 1584), and Theodore Beza, *Propositions and Principles of Divinity* (Edinburgh, 1591).

[71] Rutherford, "Conversion Narrative," 166.

her own conversion experience at a young age, faith equaled neither confidence nor spiritual ease, as the Devil remained her constant antagonist.

John Stevenson, a farmer in Carrick in the early eighteenth century, composed a deathbed letter to his family that detailed a similar experience of fear and trembling at thoughts of sin and Satan. He wrote that once, while he was recalling the sins and misdeeds of his youth, the Devil flooded his mind with fearful thoughts: "[Satan] violently suggested to my soul that some time or other, God would suddenly destroy me as with a thunder clap. Which so filled my soul with fear and pain, that every now and then I looked about me to receive the divine blow, still expecting it was a coming; yea, many nights I durst not sleep, lest I had awakened in everlasting flames."[72] Such fear and hopelessness were common parts of religious experiences of Scots, resulting from a combination of demonic beliefs and pastorally encouraged introspection.

Elizabeth Blackadder, the daughter of a covenanting minister, spoke similarly of demonically induced sleepless nights and expectations of divine retribution. She told how, at the age of six, she "had a very early conviction of sin and terrors of hell, even to that degree, that when I had gone to bed, I could not sleep but sorrow and weep under the fear of God's wrath."[73] Whether these were truly the fears of a child or their interpretation by a self-conscious adult, such accounts illustrate that in early modern Scottish society, no one, regardless of age, sex, or occupation, was considered free of innate sin and Satan's attending snares.

Scottish self-writings reveal, at times, lengthy explorations of the natural affinity between man and Satan. On July 5, 1640, minister John Forbes of Corse wrote that "because by sin [man] had lost his primitive dignitie . . . so the whole posteritie of Adam is subject to the bondage of Satan, and the course of his world is to walk according to the prince of the power of the air. . . . He that commiteth sin is of the devil for the devil sinneth from the beginning."[74] Adam, like Satan, fell from grace due to sin and foolish pride. Nearly a century later, in 1728, layman John Stevenson told how he came to realize that man was "the only creature, excepting devils, that ever disobeyed his holy, just, and good commandments, on which the depraved state of fallen man, and my own in particular, was more fully laid open to me than what I could well conceive before."[75] The innate similarities between the Devil and men and women, reiterated in both sermons and self-writings, reinforced an image of God as forgiving and merciful. If humans were not so debased, God's grace would not have been so extraordinary. Reformed Protestantism was a faith in which the sovereignty of God reigned supreme, and it is unsurprising that ruminations of sin and Satan should serve not only to humble believers but also to exalt God.

Pastorally encouraged self-scrutiny and discussions of the relationship between Satan and sin also directed how Scots reacted to trauma and allocated blame. In the late seventeenth century, Katharine Collace spoke of a moment of profound

[72] John Stevenson, "A Rare Soul-Strengthening and Comforting Cordial for Old and Young Christians: Being the last advice of John Stevenson, in the shire of Ayr, to his children and grandchildren," in *Select Biographies*, ed. Tweedie, 2:427.

[73] Elizabeth Blackadder, "A Short Account of the Lord's Way of Providence towards me in my Pilgrimage Journeys," in *Women's Life Writing in Early Modern Scotland: Writing the Evangelical Self*, c. 1670-c. 1730, ed. David Mullan (Aldershot, 2003), 387. Blackadder would have been six years old around 1665.

[74] Diary of John Forbes of Corse, 1624–47, NAS, CH12/18/6, fol. 238.

[75] Stevenson, "A Rare Soul-Strengthening and Comforting Cordial," 2:417.

guilt after the accidental death of her young son. She reported that Satan had whispered in her ear that she herself had caused the babe's demise, upon which "a hell arose in my conscience for blood-guiltiness. . . . I roared through the disquietness of my heart, and Satan was also let loose upon me. . . . Thus I continued in extremity for eight days, much without sleep, crying out against myself."[76] The perception of demonic assaults compounded her already devastating loss, causing Collace, in her grief, to be overcome with both anguish and self-reproach.

In a confession written in the late seventeenth century, a layman named James Gordon described all of the sins he had committed since his youth. The explicit purpose of such an account—written "for the glory of God and my own conviction and self-abhorrence in the sight of a pure and holy God"—indicates from the outset that he had internalized admonitions about human depravity. Such ideas found easy expression in his discussions of sin and Satan. Gordon reported that his first "heinous" transgression occurred at the tender age of four: "I being a young cheild was left at home on the Sabboath day and playing with the neighbouring children in the next house was caused by the eldest of them to imitate man and wife with a young femal cheild. Therefore . . . I myself so early made to be one of Satans servants makes me to fear lest he have power given him by God to tempt me to this or the like sin."[77] This was undoubtedly a traumatic and incomprehensible event for a four year old. Gordon attributed his actions to Satan (who was under the direction of a just God) and his own corruptions, with no blame placed on the older boy who orchestrated the whole thing. Belief in an intimate relationship between the Devil and human depravity, contrasted with the pure goodness of God, had shaped his hindsight and informed his interpretation of such an event.

The dangers of such introspection and demonic interaction did not go unnoticed by the ministry in Scotland. In 1688, the Scots minister Robert Rule delivered a revealing sermon that detailed how the Devil manipulated man's natural proclivity to fear and doubt. "Of all the creatures," he began, "man is apt to torment and afflict himself with fears."[78] Rule explained that external threats were not "so dangerous as the fears that arises from within a mans self," for the Devil used these internal tendencies to cast men and women "into despondency, and unbelief and distrust of [God's] promises."[79] The weakness of the mortal mind cooperated with Satan by allowing and even inviting such fears to enter. Only reliance on God could bring deliverance. R. A. Houston has argued that in Scotland, though invocations of the Devil were rare in understandings of actual suicide, it was not uncommon for Calvinist self-writings to contain discussions of suicidal thoughts.[80] Overcoming such thoughts served as a reflection not of the strength of the afflicted, but of the power of God's merciful intervention.

As historians have demonstrated, Satan also figured prominently in the internal experiences (and subsequently, the spiritual diaries) of the godly in England.[81]

[76] Katharine Collace, "Memoirs or Spiritual Exercises of Mistress Ros," in Mullan, *Women's Life Writing*, 39–40. This entry was composed in the late seventeenth century, but a specific date is not given.

[77] Confession of James Gordon, NAS, GD248/616/9, fol. 1

[78] Seventeenth century sermons, NLS, MS 5770, fol. 3.

[79] Ibid.

[80] See Houston, *Punishing the Dead* , especially 292–312.

[81] Johnstone, *The Devil and Demonism*, chapter 4; and Oldridge, *The Devil in Early Modern England*, chapter 3. On the genre of autobiography in Puritan England, see Watkins, *The Puritan Experience*;

A dramatic, yet telling, example comes from John Bunyan's *Grace Abounding to the Chief of Sinners*, published in London in 1666 and in Scotland in 1697. *Grace Abounding* would be republished in Scotland no less than eight additional times over the course of the eighteenth century.[82] Here, Bunyan recounted his past wickedness and detailed the turmoil that wracked his heart as he wrestled with sin and Satan, especially in his youth: "I should, at these years, be greatly afflicted and troubled with the thoughts of the fearful torments of hell-fire; still fearing, that it would be my lot to be found at last among those devils and hellish fiends, who are there bound down with the chains and bonds of darkness."[83] Driven to desperate episodes of psychological struggle against Satan, he remembered crying in bed late into the night, until he was breathless and exhausted. "Oh!" he lamented, "The diligence of Satan! The desperateness of man's heart!"[84] Later in life, before his conversion, Bunyan became convinced he had sinned beyond redemption. He began "to shake and totter under the sense of the dreadful judgment of God, that should fall on those that have sinned that most fearful and unpardonable sin."[85] In both English and Scottish spiritual diaries, disturbing thoughts of atheism often appeared in the minds of the godly in the midst of demonic experiences—including the unpardonable sin—leading them to obsess about grace and the threat of damnation.

Another noteworthy English example comes from the diary of navigator and surveyor Richard Norwood.[86] In it, he wrote that even after his conversion experience at the age of 26, Satan remained a constant antagonist. At one point, in considering the sins of his past, Norwood entered into a panic over his possible reprobation. His desperate state was exacerbated by the sense of Satan overcoming him physically as well as spiritually: "It is hard to express the manner of it, but sometimes he [the devil] seemed to lean on my back or arms or shoulder, sometimes hanging on my cloak or gown."[87]At one point, he questioned if he himself was a Devil.[88] Norwood's experiences with Satan made him worry that "the Lord had or should utterly cast me off," exemplifying the extreme despair and estrangement from God that characterized the internalization of the demonic.[89]

William Matthews, "Seventeenth- Century Autobiography," in *Autobiography, Biography, and the Novel*, ed. William Matthews and Ralph W. Rader (Los Angeles, 1973); Effie Botonaki, "Seventeenth-Century English Women's Spiritual Diaries: Self-Examination, Covenanting and Account-Keeping," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 30, no. 1 (1999): 3–21; Paul Seaver, *Wallington's World: A Puritan Artisan in Seventeenth-Century London* (Stanford, 1985).

[82] John Bunyan, *Grace abounding to the chief of sinners, or, A brief and faithful relation of the exceeding mercy of God in Christ* (London, 1666).

[83] Ibid., paragraph 6.

[84] Ibid., paragraph 139.

[85] Ibid., paragraph 164.

[86] Richard Norwood, *The Journal of Richard Norwood Surveyor of Bermuda*, ed. W. F. Craven and W. B. Hayward (New York, 1945).

[87] Ibid., 93.

[88] Ibid., 95.

[89] Ibid., 101. On perceptions of the Devil in cases of religious melancholy in Calvinist England more broadly, see Jeremy Schmidt, *Melancholy and Care of the Soul: Religion, Moral Philosophy and Madness in Early Modern England* (Aldershot, 2007), 64–77. See also Johnstone, *The Devil and Demonism*, especially chapter 4.

Despite the many similarities in the darker sides of Scottish and English demonic encounters, one interesting difference bears noting: the lack of detailed descriptions of the Devil in Scotland. In England, Protestant authors recorded their beliefs about and experiences with Satan in "a remarkable variety of forms," recounting the sights, smells, and sounds of their demonic encounters. In one particularly colorful account, the preacher John Rogers reported how Satan and his helpers had tormented him "in severall ugly shapes and forms (according to my fancies) and sometimes with great rolling flaming eyes like sawcers, having fire-brands in one of their hands, and with the other reaching at me to tear me away to torment."[90] In Scotland, however, internal encounters with Satan generally lacked such visual imagery, involving instead the words, and occasionally the sounds, of the Devil. Satan often whispered in godly ears, but appeared less frequently as a vision or corporeal entity. When Scots did claim to have seen the Devil, they usually did so in a dream or in a fever, and provided only terse descriptions of Satan in their accounts.[91]

This divergence comes, in part, from the fact that Scots were exposed to far fewer images of the Devil than were their English counterparts. The hyper-iconoclasm of Reformed Protestantism in Scotland led not only to whitewashed church walls but also to a dearth of images from the printing press. Part of this was logistical, as the Scottish print industry lagged behind England, producing little popular "cheap print" until the latter half of the seventeenth century.[92] Even after 1700, printed broadsides still contained very few images. The lack of demonic imagery during such internal experiences was also due to the fact that Scotland's break with the Catholic Church was more abrupt and thoroughgoing than England's. Scotland lacked the persistence of medieval depictions of the Devil and of Hell, which continued to appear in printed woodcuts even after the Reformation in England.[93] The Protestant de-emphasis of the physicality of the Devil bled into spiritual diaries, as reduced exposure to images of Satan combined with the emphasis on internal demonic threats to create a dearth of colorful descriptions of the Devil.[94] This distinction notwithstanding, the godly throughout early modern Britain shared the tendency to internalize messages about Satan and sin, messages that found dramatic expression during periods of stress and self-examination.

THE ENEMY WITHIN

As historians have long acknowledged, Reformed Protestantism set the bar for living very high. The challenge lay in not only controlling one's actions and words, but also one's thoughts. This was no easy task for Scots who had been constantly reminded,

[90] Cited by Oldridge, *The Devil in Early Modern England*, 41–43.

[91] See, for example, Diary of Sir George Maxwell of Pollock, 1655–66, NLS, MS. 3150, fol. 28; Mistress Rutherford, "Conversion narrative," 153; Blackadder, "A short account," 387. One exception is the colorful account of the Devil and hell found in Religious diary, 1679–1692, NAS, Ch12/20/9, fol.15.

[92] On printing in Scotland, see Alastair J. Mann, "The Anatomy of the Printed Book in Early Modern Scotland," *Scottish Historical Review* 80, no. 2 (2001): 181–200. For a discussion of the proliferation of broadsides in early modern England, see Tessa Watt's foundational Work, *Cheap Print and Popular Piety in England* (Cambridge, 1993).

[93] Oldridge, *The Devil in Early Modern England*, 145–47.

[94] Descriptions of the Devil in cases of Scottish witchcraft were also surprisingly terse or quotidian, and very rarely monstrous or grotesque as in elsewhere in Europe. On this point, see Miller, "Men in Black."

from a very young age, of their own moral and mental frailty. While imprisoned in 1667 for opposition to Charles II, the Covenanter Sir John Chiesly found himself overcome by concerns for the aberrations of his heart and soul. "O my soul," he lamented, "thou art become so sloathfull in following the Lord, why dost thou so wander in prayer, and thy heart is not fixed . . ."[95] He wondered whether this spiritual laxity was a result of his own nature or of God's letting the Devil rouse him to sin. "O my soul," he implored, "is the lord become better and thou worse, or doest thou but see more of thy own naughtiness then formerly, or doth the Lord let Satan ever more lose and not restrain thy corruptions as formerly? O what a vast wilderness of sin and wickedness do I see in my heart."[96] In his own wandering thoughts, he perceived an experiential muddle of Reformed Protestant convictions: the greatness of God, his own spiritual feebleness, and the powerful wiles of Satan.

Darren Oldridge has suggested that the fact that the Devil could inject evil thoughts into human minds provided an opportunity for the godly to profess their secret doubts and desires without the risk of appearing to be the author of these thoughts.[97] Yet even if Satan was identified as the source of such transgressions, men and women in their infinite weakness were still to blame for allowing demonically induced notions into their minds. One letter, anonymously written in Scotland in 1698, explained that while the Devil often introduced blasphemous thoughts, the human heart was equally to blame, for "there is the root of all sins in [the] heart" that "yields many times" to the suggestions of Satan.[98] Moreover, as Nathan Johnstone has argued, "diabolic intrusion did not separate subversive thoughts from the conscience. . . . Protestant writers never intended that it should, but rather that is should do the reverse, forcing a self-conscious and often sustained engagement with the experience of sin, guilt and the demonic."[99] When Scottish men and women recorded their improper thoughts in self-writings, they did so with anxiety and often shame, regardless of whether these thoughts had demonic origins. They had heard many times from the pulpit that Satan and human corruption were two sides of the same coin, and they often wrote of the dual threat of "the devil and an evil heart."[100]

This is a despairing picture of the darker side of Reformed piety. It must be kept in mind that internalizing the demonic was not a consistent, universal process. Not every godly Scot underwent this process to the same degree, or at all. Moreover, Reformed piety also entailed the comforting aspects of God's promise of victory and the unity embedded in both the highs and lows of election.[101] The covenanting minister

[95] Part of the diary of Sir John Chiesly, 1667, NLS, Wod. Oct. XXXI, fol. 41rv.

[96] Ibid.

[97] Oldridge, *The Devil in Early Modern England*, 47.

[98] "An account of the exercise of a Christian," 1698, NLS, Wod. Qu. XXVIII, fols. 94r–97v.

[99] Johnstone, *The Devil and Demonism*, 129.

[100] See, for example, Marion Veitch, "An account of the Lord's gracious dealing with me and of his remarkable hearing and answering my supplications," ca. 1670–1680s, NLS, Adv. MS. 34.6.22, fol. 20; Part of an unnamed Scottish woman's spiritual diary, 1633, NAS, GD237/21/64, fol. 9.; Diary of John Forbes of Corse (1593–1648), 1624–47, NAS, CH12/18/6, fol. 114; James Nimmo, *The Narrative of Mr. James Nimmo: Written for his own Satisfaction to Keep in some remembrance the lords way dealing and kindness towards him, 1654–1709*, ed. W. G. Scott Moncrieff (Edinburgh, 1889).

[101] On the comforting dimensions and intent of the doctrine of predestination, see Dixon, *Practical Predestinarians in England*.

John Welwood echoed this sentiment in a 1676 letter when he wrote that the elect "have need of trials and afflictions to purge out our corruptions, and this hath been the lot of all his people in all ages.[102] Some Scots may have even found comfort in the knowledge that struggles with Satan and the self, often popularized in printed spiritual diaries, were part of the larger, communal plight of the elect. Because there was no recourse to good works as a means of achieving grace, the most that Reformed Scots could do was to examine themselves with fear and repentance, struggle against the assaults of Satan, and acknowledge that this was part of their godly fate.[103]

Accordingly, some historians have focused on the hopeful, constructive side of demonic experiences and rejected a more despairing interpretation of Reformed Protestantism. Nathan Johnstone has argued that the experience of the Devil was "far more differentiated than the historical emphasis on the darker psychological implications of predestinarian theology suggest."[104] Jeremy Schmidt points out that despite the scholarly emphasis on the psychologically negative consequences of Calvinist predestinarianism, it should not be overlooked that for Protestants and Catholics alike, moments of despair were thought of as "both common occurring features of the Christian life and as spiritually healthy, or at least health-inducing."[105] Recently, Alec Ryrie has suggested that Protestants in Reformation Britain were even attracted to spiritual warfare against Satan because it entailed the promise of absolute and final victory.[106]

While the hopeful, communal elements of spiritual warfare are crucial to understanding the varied realities of Reformed piety, the negative ways in which the emphasis on sin, Satan, and salvation shaped lived experiences cannot be discounted. As Margo Todd has written, the problem of human sin created in the redeemed a tension through that "puritan self-fashioning" was both a constructive and a destructive process; the creation of the godly self entailed the purging of the innately evil self.[107] This experiential "purging" often entailed a heavy dose of self-scrutiny and self-loathing during traumatic encounters with Satan.

Moreover, it should not be assumed that the majority of Reformed men and women, in the face of such despairing experiences, would have found solace in unity or the doctrine of election. Messages of grace themselves were imbedded with uncertainty. Conversions, demonic assaults, and the innate desire to live a godly life were noteworthy signposts of election, but even with these assurances, grace was not a guarantee. Moreover, many Scots, like James Fraser of Brea, John Welwood, or Mistress Rutherford, continued to struggle against Satan long after their conversion experiences. As demonstrated above, it was the acute awareness of one's own sinfulness as much as anxiety about election that led many of the godly into intense periods of personal despair and even suicidal thoughts.

Of course, neither insecurity over salvation nor acknowledgement of personal depravity explains why some Scots experienced Satan more palpably and dramatically

[102] John Welwood, "Letters, 1675–77," in *Protestant Piety*, 85.
[103] This point is also made about English Protestants in Schmidt, *Melancholy and Care of the Soul*, 54.
[104] Johnstone, *The Devil and Demonism*, 108.
[105] Schmidt, *Melancholy and Care of the Soul*, 541.
[106] Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, 247.
[107] Margo Todd, "Puritan Self-Fashioning: The Diary of Samuel Ward," *Journal of British Studies* 31, no. 3 (1992): 262.

than others. The question of why the Devil drove some Scots to suicidal despair, troubled but did not confound others, while barely leaving a mark on the lucky ones begs further inquiry. What accounts for this variety of demonic experiences? Despite shared patterns in their encounters with Satan, one cannot discount the influence of personality, past experience, and present affliction in informing how Scots perceived and responded to demonic assaults. Exposure over the course of a lifetime to dramatic sermons on Satan, spiritual depravity, and damnation clearly informed the internalization of certain ideas. It is thus unsurprising that many of the Scots who encountered the Devil in the most dramatic fashions were the wives, children, or members of the Scottish clergy. This was not only the literate group most likely to keep spiritual diaries, but also those most exposed both to discussions of theological issues and, in the later part of the seventeenth century, religious persecution.

Past trauma or illness also attended many accounts of internalizing the demonic. Mistress Rutherford, a woman orphaned at a tender age, reported being very ill just before the worst of her encounters with Satan. For Kathleen Collace, the height of her demonic anxiety occurred just after the untimely death of her young bairn. Undoubtedly, the combination of past and present suffering with periods of physical or mental weakness rendered some Scots especially susceptible to a dangerous obsession with the Devil and depravity. While it is important to note that women were more apt to record periods of emotional distress in greater detail, in general their experiences of Satan had much in common with their male counterparts. This is an area that needs further attention and exploration.[108] For those men and women unable to keep spiritual diaries, it is difficult to assess to what extent ideas about Satan influenced their conceptions of self. It seems unlikely, though, that the frequent sermonic discussions of the Devil's relationship to human depravity would have completely escaped the attention of ordinary and educated parishioners alike. What is clear is that for a significant number of individuals, introspective anxieties about sin, Satan, and salvation collided, often dramatically, in the process of internalizing the demonic.

"A DEVIL WEAKLY FETTERED"[109]

The close relationship between Satan and human nature, within the context of predestinarian thought, undergirded and necessitated the Reformed practice of intense introspection in early modern Scotland. The contemplation of ideas about the Devil, innate depravity, and salvation resulted in powerful internal struggles and self-loathing, culminating in some individuals with internalizing the demonic. This process was by no means confined to Scottish borders; it occurred among Reformed Protestants in England and, though beyond the scope of this article, New England.[110] Throughout the anglophone world, an obsession with Satan, human

[108] For a discussion of the role of introspection and self-doubt in women's self-writings, see *Women's Life Writing*, ed. Mullan; and Patricia Demers, *Women's Writing in English: Early Modern England* (Toronto, 2005).

[109] This phrase comes from Robert Louis Stevenson and Fanny De Grift Stevenson, *More New Arabian Nights: The Dynamiter* (New York, 1885), 321.

[110] See, for example, Baird Tipson, "The Routinized Piety of Thomas Shepard's Diary," *Early American Literature* 13, no 1 (1978): 65.

sin, and the attending need for introspection was championed from pulpits and internalized by earnest and anxious Protestants.

Was the process of internalizing the demonic unique, at least in frequency, to the Anglophone world? David Mullan has examined the differences between French and Scottish Calvinism in order to test whether or not the versions of Reformed piety present in the British world "might have encouraged a 'hotter' type of Protestant—perhaps more energetic in the performance of personal duties, including an Augustinian, introspective self-analysis."[111] While rightly rejecting any clear-cut delineation of "hot" versus "lukewarm" Protestantism, Mullan points out that French diaries and memoirs reflected religious commitment but were "not designed as self-examination nor as a means of revealing the inner person with all of its attendant conflicts." He also notes that, unlike their Scottish counterparts, French Huguenot ministers do not appear to have "exploited" this focus on introspection and its ensuing melancholy.[112] Further comparative research into the demonic experiences of Reformed Protestants on the Continent would reveal fascinating insights into how a focus on introspective piety might shape the place of Satan in lives and communities throughout the early modern world.[113]

Rather than making the Devil more remote, demonic interactions in Scotland ultimately relocated the struggle against Satan to the terrestrial realm—within the human heart and mind. This does not mean that the early modern period ought to be viewed as some sort of cosmic halfway house on the way to the Enlightenment and the "disenchantment" of the world.[114] In post-Reformation Scotland, Satan certainly retained his supernatural status, as men and women of all sorts continued to view him as a powerful non-human entity. Reformed Protestantism, however, eroded any rigid divide between the supernatural evil of Satan and the natural evil of man. The godly in Scotland, thanks in large part to the clerical promotion of self-surveillance, increasingly attributed all evil to the internal cooperation and coexistence of the Devil and human depravity. For these members of Reformed faith, then, the battle against Satan was not taking place in the cosmos, with God and the Devil vying for human souls. This war had become an earthly one, and the depraved human heart provided a fertile battleground.

For many Scots, the unwavering emphasis on the intimacy of Satan and humankind's "evil hearts" profoundly shaped their religious experiences and personal identities. When Robert Louis Stevenson wrote in 1885 that "man is but a devil weakly fettered by some generous beliefs and impositions," he expressed a conviction recorded by many of his fellow Scots centuries before him: postlapsarian men and women would struggle with Satan throughout their lives on earth, not only as a necessary part of the path to salvation, but as an integral piece of their deepest selves.[115]

[111] David Mullan, "A Hotter Sort of Protestantism? Comparisons between French and Scottish Calvinisms," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 39, no 1 (2008): 45–69, at 45.

[112] Ibid.

[113] Jonathan L. Pearl has explored the political, but not experiential, dimensions of demonology in France. See Pearl, *The Crime of Crimes: Politics and Demonology in France*.

[114] This argument has long been the subject of historical debates, which have been recently summarized in Alexandra Walsham's excellent historiographical essay, "The Reformation and 'The Disenchantment of the World' Reassessed," *Historical Journal* 51, no. 2 (2008): 497–528.

[115] Stevenson, *More New Arabian Nights*, 321.